ORIGINAL



COMMISSIONERS TOM FORESE - Chairman Arizona Corporation Commandy TOBIN DOCKETE DETIN OLSON



COMMISSIONER

Direct Line: (602) 542-3625 Email: Tobin-Web@azcc.gov

DOCKETED

ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION

October 4, 2018

RE: Arizona Energy Modernization Plan (AZEMP) and Clean Resource Energy Standard & Tariff (CREST)

My Fellow Commissioners:

Rulemaking Docket (RU-00000A-18-0284)

In voting to have Staff open this new AZEMP and CREST rulemaking docket, I want to thank all of you for coming together and formalizing this initial step toward the first comprehensive energy plan in Arizona since the 1980's. I appreciate all of our participants for their input and hard work over the last several years, including responding to multiple Notice of Inquiries (NOIs) requested by commissioners and Staff. The regulated utilities, Tesla, Vote Solar, Southwest Energy Efficiency Project (SWEEP), the Western Grid Group, Western Resource Advocates, Residential Utility Consumer Office (RUCO), forest groups, conservative organizations, and numerous other individual consumers and stakeholder groups deserve special recognition for their hand in moving this forward. Together, we have accomplished much, and I'm glad we have achieved harmony in seeking to move forward with this process.

The history of this process began modestly, with only a few workshops dating as far back as ten years ago, but has arguably become the most monumental progression of public policy at the Commission to-date. Our initial workshops were held to get a foundational understanding of peak demand, the duck curve, and intermittent generation on Arizona's energy system. Senator Frank Pratt, Commissioner Bob Stump, and I lead the charge on these discussions, and numerous stakeholders voiced their input and offered potential solutions, which helped lead to the CREST rules I am refiling today. Commissioners who were present at these workshops recall the unique impression the discussions left in their minds, on just how complex these energy issues are for Arizona. Tesla, for example, told Solar City that net metering was obstructing practical adoption of battery storage in Arizona, while our utilities told the Commission that the Navajo Generating Station (NGS) was an integral part of their long-term plans.

While a comprehensive energy plan may not have been the Commission's original motive, several commissioners in the 2016-timeframe realized after these modest workshops that the energy landscape was dramatically shifting and that the original Renewable Energy Standard & Tarff (REST) rules were in desperate need of modernization. The conversation certainly accelerated when some of the same utilities that said NGS was a part of their long-term plans reversed course and determined that 2,200 MWs of reliable, baseload energy would be taken offline essentially overnight, with a complete and total shutdown to occur in as few as 2 years. The Commission hosted an 8-hour workshop on baseload security to learn what "baseload" really meant, and for the first time in the Commission's history, we denied our utilities' Integrated Resource Plans (IRPs) and put a 9-month moratorium on natural gas investment in an attempt to figure it all out. This moratorium is imperative because it has bought the Commission time to try and adopt a forward-looking energy policy and prevent future stranded assets for Arizona's ratepayers.

It is apparent that over-building of any particular generation by regulated utilities would almost guarantee significant costs incurred for new transmission and pipeline infrastructure and stranded assets on these same resources within our lifetimes. The fact that Arizona hasn't had a comprehensive energy plan since the 1980's only emphasizes the risks we contemplated with respect to these actions, and it is critical that we stop and take a deep look at what the actual energy policy is going to be for the state moving forward. The Commission is unified on

these points, with many votes passing 5 to 0 because it is clear that the IRPs as presented by the utilities favor a significant transition that is counter to this proposed Energy Modernization Plan.

After reviewing the extensive record of discovery surrounding a multitude of energy policies, it is clear that the information gathered needed to be compiled into a comprehensive energy plan for this Commission to consider. After consulting with Staff on how to proceed, I was advised by Utilities Director Elijah Abinah that the best way forward was to "update the REST standards already on the books in our administrative code."

In January of 2018 the proposed Arizona Energy Modernization Plan (AZEMP) was released with a series of guiding principles and policies that I believed would position our State at the forefront of energy policy in the country, drive us towards a cleaner, more sustainable future, and protect ratepayers for generations to come. In February 2018, Utilities Director Abinah advised that the best way to proceed was to issue a Notice of Inquiry (NOI) to allow the commissioners to pose any questions they had regarding the tenets of the plan.

On February 22, 2018 this NOI was issued with a series of over 175 questions covering a variety of issues in the AZEMP, including forest biomass, energy storage, nuclear power, and electric vehicle charging stations. Upon completion of the NOI response period on April 23, 2018 my staff and I set to work on crafting a formal set of draft rules for the Commission's review and a possible vote to send to the formal rulemaking process.

Director Abinah specifically requested that these proposed rules be drafted by one or more of the commissioners on his behalf, so that his office would not be burdened with the additional labor while trying to juggle numerous other cases still ongoing at the Commission this year. Both the Legal and Hearings Division Staff were instrumental in assisting in this process. For instance, Deputy Director Sarah Harpring created a rule-drafting outline of the AZEMP for us to follow, and Maureen Scott gave us a copy of the existing REST rule language, which we consulted while drafting the specific rules.

On May 25, members of Staff received a copy of revised draft language to review; on June 1, Commissioner Dunn, his Policy Advisor, and our Chief Legal Counsel received a revised copy of the draft language to review; and on June 8, RUCO received a revised copy of the language to review.

After incorporating feedback from over **50 stakeholders** in the NOI process, Sarah Harpring's outline, the existing REST rules, revisions from participating members of Staff, RUCO, and our Chief Council, and the policy positions of any commissioner who articulated a clear position on an issue over the last 2 years, we originated the redline language upon which the Commission acknowledged it would now like to move forward. The exact text of the CREST rules I am refiling today incorporate the substantive suggestions and stylistic revisions of Staff and stakeholders with decades of experience in Arizona utilities and rulemaking. They also encapsulate the complexity of the issues the Commission began exploring years ago at its modest beginnings.

I respect all the parties for participating and appreciate them for being a part of this process and contributing to the final language of the rules. The AZEMP and accompanying CREST rules are the conservative and calculated products of the information accumulated in the above dockets and workshops over the last several years, which ultimately combines the following inseparable components: an 80% goal for clean energy, a 3,000 MW goal for energy storage capacity, a 60 MW requirement for biomass generation, a 15% Clean Peak Standard, and a goal to spur electric vehicle (EV) charging stations in the state.

On August 14, 2018, the Commission directed Staff to initiate this Rulemaking docket to evaluate many of the principles highlighted in the AZEMP and begin the formal process as Staff enumerated earlier this year. Hearing Division Director and Deputy Director, Jane Rodda and Sarah Harpring, gave my office a complete map of the rulemaking process in February, and I'd especially like to thank them for their excellent recapitulation of that detailed account for the other commissioners to hear at the Staff Meeting in August. Chairman Forese had asked the Utilities Division several times to provide such a map for the commissioners to review, but to-date the Utilities Division has never docketed such a map. I believe this emphasizes many of the issues at the Commission with

respect to the process to date, and I agree that the process has been at times confusing. Clarifying and improving this process in the future should be a priority for the Commission moving forward.

As I stated in two letters dated June 22 and July 5, and as Jane Rodda and Sarah Harpring reiterated in August, voting on the proposal served as an acknowledgement to the public that the Commission needed a plan and moved the proposed AZEMP and CREST language forward for specific redline discussions. Having formally taken that step, Staff must now prepare a Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (NOPR) for the Commission to review and a Recommended Order and Opinion (ROO) authorizing Staff to file the NOPR with the Secretary of State, which must include a Preamble, Economic Impact Statement, and the exact text of the rules, along with a sufficient evidentiary record and due process to support the rulemaking.

With the hard work and unified commitment of all parties involved, two of these most arduous steps have already been completed. For judicial efficiency and to help alleviate the work for Staff, all of the relevant dockets, workshops, documents, and evidentiary records listed below have been docketed to this Rulemaking Docket on behalf of the Commission, to support proceeding with the exact text of the rules as written, to provide the sufficient evidentiary record upon which they are based, and to finally house all the material in the same location.

Accordingly, I am docketing the proposed CREST rules along with all of the relevant dockets, workshops, documents, and evidentiary records that support the Commission's decision to move forward with these AZEMP and CREST proposals, as highlighted below:

Docket: E-01345A-08-0569; APS for approval of Demand Response Program.

Docket: E-01345A-10-0123; Arizona Public Service Company's Electric Vehicle Filing.

Docket: E-00000V-13-0070; Resource Planning and Procurement in 2013 and 2014.

Docket: E-00000XX-13-0214; Investigation to address EE/DSM cost effectiveness.

Docket: E-00000J-14-0023; Investigation of Value and Cost of Distributed Generation.

Docket: E-00000V-15-0094; Resource planning and procurement.

Docket: E-01345A-15-0182; APS for a ruling relating to its 2016 DSM Implementation plan.

Docket: E-00000J-15-0182; Demand-side management and peak demand reductions.

Docket: E-01933A-15-0239; TEP for approval of its 2016 REST Implementation Plan.

Docket: E-01933A-15-0322; TEP for the establishment of just and reasonable rates.

Docket: E-00000J-15-0347; Inquiry into the rooftop solar industry in Arizona.

Docket: E-01345A-16-0036; APS for a hearing to determine the fair value of the utility property.

Docket: E-01345A-16-0176; APS for a ruling relating to its 2017 DSM Implementation Plan.

Docket: E-00000J-16-0257; Reducing system peak demand costs.

Docket: E-00000Q-16-0289; Review, Modernization and Expansion of the REST.

Docket: E-00000C-17-0039; The Future of the Navajo Generating Station.

Docket: E-00000U-17-0057; Demand-side Management progress reports.

Docket: E-01345A-17-0134; APS for a Ruling relating to its 2018 DSM Implementation Plan.

Docket: E-00000Q-17-0138; The Role of Forest Bioenergy in Arizona.

Docket: E-01933A-17-0250; TEP for approval of its 2018 EE Implementation Plan.

Docket: E-00000Q-17-0293; Evaluating Arizona's current and future baseload security.

Docket: E-00000J-18-0266; Inquiry into Electric Vehicles and Electrification of the Transportation Sector.

Workshop: Energy Efficiency Cost Effectiveness (March 18, 2014)

Workshop: Energy Efficiency Cost Recovery (March 31, 2014)

Workshop: Incorporating Energy Efficiency into Integrated Resource Planning (April 17, 2014)

Workshop: Rooftop Solar Industry (October 14, 2015)

Workshop: Integrated Resource Planning and Emerging Technologies (February 26, 2015)

Workshop: Integrated Resource Plans (July 18, 2016)

Workshop: Reducing System Peak Demand Costs (August 4, 2016)

Workshop: Demand-Side Management and Peak Demand Reduction Programs (November 29, 2016)

Workshop: Integrated Resource Plans (November 29, 2016)

Workshop: Battery Storage Technology (March 20, 2017)

Workshop: Coal Markets (April 6, 2017)

Workshop: REST Review (June 7, 2017)

Workshop: Baseload Security (November 9th, 2017) Workshop: Forest Bioenergy (December 5, 2017)

While not all commissioners were able to participate in every workshop or read every NOI response, the exact text of the proposed CREST rules followed closely Staff's recommendations to incorporate the interests and priorities that resonate the most with each our fellow commissioners, both current and prior. Commissioners Olson, Dunn, and Forese, for example, have long supported flexibility and autonomy for electric co-ops: as such, the proposed redlines to R14-2-1814 maintain the existing exemption to co-ops, and the proposed redlines to R14-2-1818 for biomass are written to exempt utilities that deliver under 100,000 MWhs/year. These commissioners also all oppose mandate-type approaches to implementing energy policies: accordingly, the proposed redlines to R14-2-1813 only ask affected utilities to develop compliance plans. Commissioner Burns and former Commissioner Kris Mayes, for example, have long been staunch advocates of emerging technologies and of propping-up residential, customer-based industries: the proposed redlines to R14-2-1813 and R14-2-1821 promote new technologies and allow regulated utilities to count customer-cited energy storage technologies toward their respective long-term goals. Commissioners Forese, Olson, and I have historically opposed carbon taxes and creating new credit frameworks to track and record utility progress on an ongoing basis: accordingly, the proposed redlines to R14-2-1818 for biomass and R14-2-1821 for the Clean Peak Standard use only the existing Renewable Energy Credits (RECs) framework so no new credits would be created. Former Commissioner Little and I have both expressed our views that nuclear generation is essential for the success of any future clean energy mix: as such, the proposed redlines to R14-2-1820 recognize nuclear energy as a clean energy resource. This Commission as a whole agrees that on-peak hours represent the highest costs for residential Arizonans and that reducing peak demand is a priority for the Commission: accordingly, the proposed redlines to R14-2-1821 address peak-demand directly, seeking to lower the cost of storage and bring clean energy to customers' most expensive hours of the day and night. Staff wants to see electric Energy Efficiency (EE) and Gas EE opened for rulemaking: the proposed redlines to R14-2-1811 order Staff to commence these rulemakings within 120 days. Our regulated utilities want flexibility to transition to clean energy according to their own needs and circumstances: the proposed redlines to R14-2-1812 and R14-2-1813 allow the utilities to develop these plans as they see fit within the broader framework of the plan. Finally, Staff wants to exercise a degree of control over the process moving forward: the proposed redlines to R14-2-1811 allow Staff to conduct a recurring review of this plan in a manner it deems most efficient.

Although Chairman Forese said, "the language is concerning," he also received a Word document version of the draft rules 14 days earlier, and we have yet to receive any redline recommendations from him indicating or resolving his concerns. While the proposed language will never be perfect, the CREST rules as written put it all together into a package that addresses pieces every stakeholder had a part in. As I said in January with the original AZEMP announcement, there would be no surprises. I have worked diligently to uphold that principle, so all parties would feel comfortable with the plan as it exists today. There will still be plenty of opportunities for additional stakeholder input and I do believe that directing Staff to proceed with rule making was the most appropriate way to hold meaningful discussions moving forward.

There is more work to be done and valid points for the commission to discuss which call our attention. Commissioners Burns and Dunn want to reconsider amending the Constitution to deregulate the retail electric industry; Staff wants to re-write the Biennial Transmission Assessment (BTA) statutes; Commissioner Olson has concerns with respect to the biomass and EV portions of the AZEMP; and while Commissioner Dunn supports biomass, he also has questions on EV policy not included in the original NOI.

While there are additional policy discussions like these for the Commission to consider, I feel the AZEMP and CREST rules should be put into an NOPR format immediately. The AZEMP was proposed in January, and a vote to move forward with the process did not occur until August. This delay of several months demonstrates that additional conversations have done nothing to improve the specific language or advance the process in moving forward. To-date Staff has made no substantive filing in this new AZEMP & CREST Rulemaking Docket since its opening on August 17, almost two months ago. At the same time, these proposals have received widespread praise and support from a host of stakeholders and industry professionals, including from the Arizona Chamber of Commerce, Nature Conservancy, and RUCO. Clearly the business community, environmental groups, partnering

governmental agencies, impacted utilities, and most notably, ratepayers are hoping for our action in quickly identifying an energy plan for the future.

As each of us continue to embark on our individual journeys to explore various respective policy positions, the process should not be delayed when these issues can run concurrently and as the policy details will be further vetted and discussed throughout the formal rulemaking process. Meaningful debate on the specific redline items is the most productive next step, and we should get there as soon as possible.

The cost of further Commission inaction is too great. We have made significant progress by halting certain utility plant investments without having a comprehensive plan, but that was always intended to be a temporary fix. It is now on us to make real moves towards such a plan. The longer we wait, the greater risk we face of catastrophic wildfires, stranded assets with higher ratepayer costs, uncertainty for business and investment in our state, and the continuing threat of air quality issues. Indeed, the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ) has warned that Arizona could face nearly \$300 million in annual costs should we not address our air quality issues, and formal EV policies like those highlighted in this plan would help. While reasonable minds may disagree on which policies are the best for Arizona, the Commission needs to act and clearly articulate our vision for the future to let stakeholders know where we stand.

The final piece of the AZEMP and CREST rules the commissioners have yet to receive is a financial analysis of the plan on ratepayers. Commissioners Burns, Forese, Olson, and I have all asked for this, and while SWEEP and the Western Resource Advocates estimate that over \$500 million dollars could be saved between now and 2032 if utilities adopt portfolios that emphasize clean energy deployment and energy storage technology, their portfolios are similar, but not identical, to the AZEMP. The Economic Impact Statement Staff will develop as part of its ROO and NOPR filing will likely represent the result of our respective requests. When it appears, we ask that it be shared immediately with the commissioners for their respective review.

Until then, I would ask Staff to please review if this isn't an appropriate place to accelerate the informal process by moving forward with the redline language already provided. It is my feeling that the remaining pieces that lack evidentiary maturity, such as deregulation, net metering, interconnection, and blockchain, should be carved out in the short term and addressed in future rulemaking efforts.

To this point, I would respectfully request that, as Staff moves forward with drafting one or more NOPRs, Staff simultaneously prepare at least one NOPR wherein the CREST rules docketed again today provide the exact text of the rules as written. I also ask Staff to docket a motion in the last IRP docket before the next Open Meeting on October 11, requesting that the Commission consider extending or expiring the natural gas moratorium until Staff's NOPRs have been completed and voted on.

I ask Staff to provide a status update on its progress in drafting the NOPR to-date and on its plan to have my version of the NOPR timely prepared. I ask that Staff be prepared to deliver this status update at the next Open Meeting on October 11.

Due to the volume of the documents, and to conserve Commission resources, the evidentiary record is being provided without 13 additional copies and can be found electronically, here: http://edocket.azcc.gov/Docket/ http://edocket.azcc.gov/Docket/ DocketDetailSearch?docketId=21658#docket-detail-container2. As seen in the photo included on the next page, 13 copies of the documents included in this filing would be redundant and wasteful.

Sincerely,

Andy Tobin, Commissioner

R.M. Toli

E-01933A-17-0250 E-0000Q-17-0138 E-01345A-17-0134 Forest Bioenergy E-01345A-08-0569 Electric Vehicles E-00000J-18-0266 EV-Ready Project E-01345A-10-0123 Cope Marries - No. 75 (200) Copies Operation - Mos. 11 (201) Copies Operation - August (201) E-01933A-15-0322 E-01345A-16-0036 E-01345A-15-0182 E-01345A-16-0176 E-01933A-15-0239 E-00000J-16-0257 Battery Storage Peak Demand E-00000J-15-0347 E-00000J-14-0023 Rooftop Solar Value of Solar States Cover - Onter J. 2015 states or Sarkey State Interior - October in 2015 E-00000Q-17-0293 Baseload Security E-00000C-17-0039 Text of the Rules Proposed Exact Future of NGS roposad Redlines completed Rule-Draffing Outline wi Note: (CREST) Modernization Plan Arizona Energy **REST Modernization** E-000000-16-0289 Resource Planning E-000000XX-13-0214 E-00000V-13-0070 E-00000V-15-0094 **Energy Efficiency** Onse-Pager Introduction Guidding Principles Modernized Policies Fact Sheet Pour Sheet On this 4th day of October, 2018,the foregoing document was filed with Docket Control as a Correspondence From Commissioner, and copies of the foregoing were mailed on behalf of Andy Tobin, Commissioner - A.C.C. to the following who have not consented to email service. On this date or as soon as possible thereafter, the Commission's eDocket program will automatically email a link to the foregoing to the following who have consented to email service.

Arizona Corporation Commission - Rulemaking RU-00000A-18-0284

A. B. Baardson 6463 N. Desert Breeze CT. Tucson AZ 85750

Alan Kierman IO DATA CENTERS, LLC 615 N. 48th St Phoenix AZ 85008

Albert H. Acken One N. Central Ave Ste 1200 Phoenix AZ 85004

Amanda Ormond WESTERN GRID GROUP 2303 N. Timberline Rd. Flagstaff AZ 86004

Andrew Wang SOLARRESERVE, LLC 520 Broadway, 6th Fl. Santa Monica CA 90401

Annie Lappe 1120 Pearl St, Ste 200 Boulder CO 80302

Benjamin Lowe ALEVO USA INC. 2321 Concord Pkwy S. Concord NC 28027 Ajo Improvement Company Roy Archer, President/Manager P.O. Drawer 9, S. Highway 85 Ajo AZ 85321

Albert H. Acken RYLEY CARLOCK & APPLEWHITE One North Central Ave, Ste 1200 Phoenix AZ 85004

Alliant Gas, LLC 200 W. Longhorn Rd Payson AZ 85541

Amanda Ormond WESTERN GRID GROUP 7650 S. McClintock, Ste. 103-282 Tempe AZ 85284

Andy Kvesic
ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
Director- Legal Division
1200 West Washington
Phoenix AZ 85007
legaldiv@azcc.gov
utildivservicebyemail@azcc.gov

Consented to Service by Email

Anthony Wanger IO DATA CENTERS, LLC 615 N. 48th St Phoenix AZ 85008 Brett Kraus 99 East 700 S. Logan UT 84321

Catherine M Mazzeo SOUTHWEST GAS CORPORATION P.O. Box 98510 Las Vegas NV 89193

Chris Hendrix 2001 S. E. 10th St Bentonville AR 72716

Christopher D. Thomas Fred E. Breedlove III SQUIRE SANDERS (US) LLP 1 East Washington, 27th Fl. Phoenix AZ 85004

Copper Market, Inc. PO Box 245 Bagdad AZ 86321

Craig Goodman Stacey Rantala National Energy Marketers Association 3333 K. St, NW - 110 Washington DC 20007

Cynthia Zwick ARIZONA COMMUNITY ACTION ASSOCIATION 2700 N. Third St. - 3040 Phoenix AZ 85004

Dan McClendon GARKANE ENERGY COOPERATIVE, INC. PO Box 465 Loa UT 84747

David Berry WESTERN RESOURCE ADVOCATES P.O. Box 1064 Scottsdale AZ 85252-1064 Brad Nelson 7001 SW 24th Ave Gainesville FL 32607

Briana Kobor 358 S. 700 E Salt Lake City UT 84102 briana@votesolar.org maddy@votesolar.rog

Consented to Service by Email

Charles Kretek
COLUMBUS ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC.
P.O. Box 631
Deming NM 88031

Christopher Hitchcock
LAW OFFICES OF CHRISTOPHER HITCHCOCK,
P.L.C
One Copper Queen Plaza
P.O. Box AT
Bisbee AZ 85603
Christopher D. Thomas
Fred E. Breedlove III
SQUIRE SANDERS (US) LLP
1 E. Washington, 27th FI.
Phoenix AZ 85004

Court S. Rich ROSE LAW GROUP, PC 7144 E. Stetson Dr., Ste. 300 Scottsdale AZ 85251

Craig A. Marks CRAIG A. MARKS, PLC 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix AZ 85028

Dan Byers GLOBAL ENERGY INSTITUTE 1615 H. St NW Washington DC 20062 Dillon Holmes CLEAN POWER ARIZONA 9635 N 7th St. #47520 Phoenix AZ 85068

Garry D Hays LAW OFFICES OF GARRY D. HAYS, PC 2198 E. Camelback Rd., Ste 305 Phoenix AZ 85016

Greg Bass NOBLE AMERICAS ENERGY SOLUTIONS 401 W. A St., Ste. 500 San Diego CA 92101-3017

Gregory L. Bernosky ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY MS 9712 PO Box 53999 Phoenix AZ 85072

Harry Kingerski 1301 McKinney, Level 12 Houston TX 77010

Heather Bernacki Wilkey 3030 N. Central Ste 1408 Phoenix AZ 85012

James M. Hamilton Hamilton Consulting 822 N. 5th Ave Phoenix AZ 85003

Jane Briesemeister 98 San Jacintro Blvd. Ste 750 Austin TX 78701

Jason Pistiner SINGER PISTINER PC 15849 N. 71st St., Ste 100 Scottsdale AZ 85254 Daniel Pozefsky
RUCO
1110 West Washington, Suite 220
Phoenix AZ 85007
cfraulob@azruco.gov
procedural@ruco.gov
dpozefsky@ruco.gov
ifuentes@ruco.gov

Consented to Service by Email

David G Hutchens UNS ELECTRIC, INC. 88 E Broadway Blvd, MS HQE901 P.O Box 711 Tucson AZ 85701-0711

Duncun Valley Electric Cooperative, Inc. PO Box 440 Duncun AZ 85534

Graham County Utilities, Inc. - Gas Division PO Drawer B Pima AZ 85543

Greg Patterson COMPETITIVE POWER ALLIANCE 916 W. Adams, Ste 3 Phoenix AZ 85007

Hannah Polikov 1000 Vermont Ave. NW, 3rd Fl. Washington DC 20005

Heather Kreager GILA BEND POWER PARTNERS 5949 Sherry Lane, Ste. 1900 Dallas TX 75225-6553

Jack Blair 311 E. Wilcox Sierra Vista AZ 85635 Jeff Woner K.R. Saline & Associates, PLC 160 N. Pasadena, Ste 101 Mesa AZ 85201

Jennifer A. Cranston
GALLAGHER & KENNEDY, P.A
2575 E. Camelback Rd.
Ste 1100
Phoenix AZ 85016-9225
Igernet@azgt.coop
jennifer.cranston@gknet.com

jwallace@gcseca.coop JCanaca@gcseca.coop

Consented to Service by Email

Joanne Bradley
Jacqueline DeRosa, Mike McGuffin
Customized Energy Solutions
101 Parkshore Dr. - 100
Folsom CA 95630

John Fernandes RENEWABLE ENERGY SYSTEMS AMERICAS INC. 11101 W. 120th Ave., Ste 400 Broomfield CO 80021

Joseph A. Drazek Quarles & Brady LLP One Renaissance Square Two N. Central Ave. Phoenix AZ 85004

Julie Rees TRIADVOCATES LLC Two N. Central Ave. - 1150 Phoenix AZ 85004

Ken Wilson WESTERN RESOURCE ADVOCATES 2260 Baseline Rd, Ste 200 Boulder CO 80302

Kevin T. Fox Keyes & Fox LLP 436 14th St. - 1305 Oakland CA 94612 James M. Hamilton Hamilton Consulting 822 N. 5th Ave Phoenix AZ 85003

Jason D. Gellman SNELL & WILMER, LLP One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren St., Ste 1900 Phoenix AZ 85004

Jeff Schlegel SWEEP ARIZONA REPRESENTATIVE 1167 W. Samalayuca Dr. Tucson AZ 85704-3224

Jeffrey Crockett CROCKETT LAW GROUP, PLLC 2198 E. Camelback Rd., Ste 305 Phoenix AZ 85016

Jennifer Kefer THE ALLIANCE FOR INDUSTRIAL EFFICIENCY 2609 11th St. N. Arlington VA 22201

Joe Cobb 4814 W. State Ave. P.O. Box 1855 Glendale AZ 85311

John Wallace 2210 S. Priest Dr. Tempe AZ 85282

Joseph W. Marvin
PRIME SOLUTIONS GROUP, INC.
1300 S. Litchfield RD, Bldg 125
Goodyear AZ 85338
JoeMarvin@psg-inc.net
meganrubstello@psg-inc.net

Consented to Service by Email

Kathy Senseman Policy Development Group 3636 N. Central Ave. - 590 Phoenix AZ 85012 Kristie Deiuliis 67 S. Bedford Rd Ste 201-E Burlington MA 01803

Ladel Laub DIXIE-ESCALANTE RURAL ELECTRIC ASSOCIATION, INC. 71 E. Hwy. 56 Beryl UT 84714-5197

Lawrence V. Robertson, Jr.
MUNGER CHADWICK, PLC
210 W. Continental RD, Ste 216A
Green Valley AZ 85622
Tubaclawyer@aol.com
greg.bass@calpinesolutions.com
mtierney-lloyd@enernoc.com

Consented to Service by Email

Lewis M. Levenson 1308 E. Cedar Lane Payson AZ 85541

Lori A Dolqueist One Embarcadero Center, 30th FI San Francisco CA 94111

Mari Hernandez INTERSTATE RENEWABLE ENERGY COUNCIL P.O Box 1156 Latham NY 12110-1156

Mark Etherton SOUTHWEST TRANSMISSION PARTNERS, LLC 2172 E. Calle de Arcos Tempe AZ 85284

Marta Darby
SIERRA CLUB
2101 Webster St., Ste 1300
Oakland CA 94612
Sandy.bahr@sierraclub.org
katherine.ramsey@sierraclub.org
marta.darby@sierraclub.org
katie.chamber!ain@sierraclub.org

Consented to Service by Email

Kenneth C. Sundlof, Jr.
JENNINGS STROUSS & SALMON, P.L.C.
One E. Washington St., Ste. 1900
Phoenix AZ 85004-2554
sundlof@jsslaw.com
mliska@jsslaw.com

Consented to Service by Email

Kevin C. Higgins ENERGY STRATEGIES, LLC 215 S. State St., Ste. 200 Salt Lake City UT 84111

Kristin K. Mayes THE KRIS MAYES LAW FIRM, PLLC 3030 N. Third St. Ste 200 Phoenix AZ 85012

Lauren Patheal TRIADVOCATES LLC Two N. Central Ave. - 1150 Phoenix AZ 85004

Leland R. Snook ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY 400 N. 5th St., MS 8695 Phoenix AZ 85004

Linda J. Benally 400 N. 5th St., MS 8695 Phoenix AZ 85004

Madonna Bixby PNM Resources Corporate Headquarters Albuquerque AZ 87158

Mario Natividad 9244 Bermundez St. Pico Rivera CA 90660-4510

Marshall Magruder PO Box 1267 Tubac AZ 85646-1267 Maura Yates SunEdison LLC 700 Lavaca St. - 1430 Austin TX 78701 Matt Derr SOUTHWEST GAS CORPORATION 1600 E. Northern Ave Phoenix AZ 85020

Meghan H. Grabel OSBORN MALEDON, P.A. 2929 N. Central Ave, Ste 2100 Phoenix AZ 85012 kruht@omlaw.com mgrabel@omlaw.com Meghaen Dell'Artino 328 E. Keim Rd Phoenix AZ 85012

Consented to Service by Email

Michael A Curtis MARTINEZ & CURTIS, P.C. 501 E. Thomas Rd Phoenix AZ 85012-3205

Michael Patten
SNELL & WILMER, LLP
One Arizona Center
400 E. Van Buren St., Ste 1900
Phoenix AZ 85004
docket@swlaw.com
bcarroll@tep.com
jthomes@swlaw.com
mpatten@swlaw.com
mdecorse@tep.com

Michael E. Sheehan 88 E Broadway Blvd. MS HQW803 Tucson AZ 85701

Consented to Service by Email

Nancy Baer 245 San Patricio Dr. Sedona AZ 86336

Michele Van Quathem LAW OFFICES OF MICHELE VAN QUATHEM, PLLC 7600 N. 15th St., Ste 150-30 Phoenix AZ 85020 Nicholas C Dranias 500 E. Coronado Rd Phoenix AZ 85004

Neil Kolwey SOUTHWEST ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROJECT 2334 N. Broadway, Ste. A Boulder CO 80304 Nitzan Goldberger ENERGY STORAGE ASSOCIATION 1800 M St., NW, Ste 400S Washington DC 20036

Nicholas J. Enoch LUBIN & ENOCH, PC 349 N. Fourth Ave. Phoenix AZ 85003

Patricia C. Ferre P.O. Box 433 Payson AZ 85547

Northern Arizona University Karin Wadsack, Project Director Box 5694 Flagstaff AZ 86011 Philene Taormina 34 Wheelock St Montpelier VT 05602 Patrick Black FENNEMORE CRAIG, P.C 2394 E. Camelback Rd, Ste 600 Phoenix AZ 85016 pblack@fclaw.com

Consented to Service by Email

Raymond A Hagerman 5101 College Blvd Farmington NM 87402

Richard Adkerson AJO IMPROVEMENT COMPANY 333 N. Central Ave Phoenix AZ 85004-2189

Rick Umoff Solar Energy Industries Association 505 9th St NW, Ste 800 Washington DC 20004

Robert J. Metli 2398 E. Camelback Rd., Ste. 240 Phoenix AZ 85016

Roy Archer MORENCI WATER AND ELECTRIC COMPANY AJO IMPROVEMENT COMPANY P.O. Box 68 Morenci AZ 85540

Ryan Harper TRIADVOCATES LLC Two N. Central Ave. - 1150 Phoenix AZ 85004

Sevasti Travlos THE ALLIANCE FOR SOLAR CHOICE LLC 595 Market St., 29th FI. San Francisco CA 94105

Stacy Tellinghuisen WESTERN RESOURCE ADVOCATES 2260 Baseline Rd Boulder CO 80302 Rebecca Wenk
PUBLIC SERVICE CO. OF NEW MEXICO
414 Silver Ave. SW
Albuquerque NM 87102

Rick Gilliam
THE VOTE SOLAR INITIATIVE
1120 Pearl St, Ste 200
Boulder CO 80302

Robert S. Lynch 340 E. Palm Lane, Ste 140 Phoenix AZ 85004-4603 rlynch@rslynchaty.com todd@rslynchaty.com

Consented to Service by Email

Robert Taylor SALT RIVER PROJECT Senior Director Regulatory Policy P.O. Box 52025 PAB4TB Phoenix AZ 85072-2025

Russell E. Jones WATERFALL, ECONOMIDIS, CALDWELL, HANSHAW & VILLAME 5210 E. Williams Circle, Ste 800 Tucson AZ 85711

Scott S. Wakefield RIDENOUR, HIENTON & LEWIS, P.L.L.C 201 N. Central Ave., Ste 3300 Phoenix AZ 85004-1052

Sidney Smith HOHOKAM IRRIGATION & DRAINAGE DISTRICT 142 S. Arizona Blvd. Coolidge AZ 85128

Stephanie Wojcik TOWN OF WICKENBURG 155 N Tegner, Ste A Wickenburg AZ 85390

Steven Lunt DUNCAN VALLEY ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE P.O Box 440 Duncan AZ 85534 Steve Jennings AARP 16165 N. 83rd Ave., Ste 201 Peoria AZ 85382

Steven Rymsha SUNRUN INC. 595 Market St, 29th Fl. San Francisco CA 94105

Sundevil Power Holdings, LLC Attn: Mark Thompson & Ray Wallander c/o Wayzata Investment Partners 701 E. Lake St. - 300 Wayzata MN 55391

Tara S Kaushik One Embarcadero Center, 30th FI San Francicso CA 94111

Than W Ashby GRAHAM COUNTY ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC. 9 W. Center St. PO Drawer B Pima AZ 85543

Thomas H. Campbell LEWIS ROCA ROTHGERBER CHRISTIE, LLP 201 E. Washington St., Ste 1200 Phoenix AZ 85004

Thomas A Loquvam
PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL CORPORATION
P.O. Box 53999, MS 8695
Phoenix AZ 85072
thomas.loquvam@pinnaclewest.com
Melissa.Krueger@pinnaclewest.com

Kerri.Carnes@aps.com

Debra.Orr@aps.com

Thomas.Mumaw@pinnaclewest.com

Theresa.Dwyer@pinnaclewest.com

Consented to Service by Email

Tim Lindl Keyes, Fox & Wiedman LLP 436 14th St. - 1305 Oakland CA 84612 Sulphur Springs Valley Electric Cooperative, Inc. 350 N. Haskell Ave. Willcox AZ 85643

Susan H. & Richard Pitcairn 1865 Gun Fury Rd. Sedona AZ 86336

Thad Kurowski 470 E. 76th Ave. Unit 3A Denver CO 80229

Thomas L. Acker 1605 N. Wood Hollow Way Flagstaff AZ 86004

Thomas Harris DISTRIBUTED ENERGY RESOURCE ALLIANCE 5215 E. Orchid Ln. Paradise Valley AZ 85253

Thomas J. Pyle
INSTITUTE FOR ENERGY RESEARCH
1155 15th St. NW, Ste 900
Washington DC 20005

Timothy M. Hogan ARIZONA CENTER FOR LAW IN THE PUBLIC INTERST 514 W. Roosevelt St. Phoenix AZ 85003

Tom Harris
ARIZONA SOLAR ENERGY INDUSTRIES
ASSOCIATION
2122 W. Lone Cactus Dr. Ste 2
Phoenix AZ 85027

Tom Wray SUNZIA SOUTHWEST 3610 N. 44th St., Ste 250 Phoenix AZ 85018 Tina Lee 2929 Allen Pkwy, Ste 2280 Houston TX 77019

Tom C. Wray SOUTHWESTERN POWER GROUP 3610 N. 44th St., Ste. 250 Phoenix AZ 85018

UNS Gas, Inc. PO Box 711, MS HQE910 Tucson AZ 85702

Valerie Hayes DIRECT SELLING ASSOCIATION 1667 K St. NW - 1100 Washington DC 20006

Vincent Nitido TRICO ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, INC 8600 W. Tangerine Rd. Marana AZ 85658

William P. Sullivan
LAW OFFICES OF WILLIAM P. SULLIVAN, PLLC
3240 E. Union Hills Dr., Ste 117
Phoenix AZ 85050
ggouker@navopache.org
jcoury@hoolcourylaw.com
cmoore@navopache.org
rheyman@swlaw.com
tcarlson@mohaveelectric.com
wps@sullivan.attorney
maw@sullivan.attorney

Consented to Service by Email

By: Daniel Schwiebert
Deputy Policy Advisor to
Commissioner Andy Tobin

UNS Electric, Inc. Attn: Melissa Morales PO Box 711 MS HQE910 Tucson AZ 85702

Vicki Sandler
ARIZONA INDEPENDENT SCHEDULING
ADMINISTRATORS ASSOCIATION
14402 S. Canyon Dr.
Phoenix AZ 85048

William Gregory Kelly FRYE LAW FIRM P.C. 10400 Academy Rd. NE, Ste.-310 Albuquerque NM 87111